

STEVEN L. BESHEAR Governor FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION CABINET DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE 501 HIGH STREET FRANKFORT, KENTUCKY 40620 Phone (502) 564-3226 Fax (502) 564-3875 www.kentucky.gov LORI HUDSON FLANERY Secretary

> THOMAS B. MILLER Commissioner

In the matter of:



FINAL RULING NO. 2012-19 March 14, 2012

Sales and Use Tax Assessments for the Period September 1, 2004 through April 30, 2008

FINAL RULING

The Kentucky Department of Revenue has outstanding sales and use tax assessments totaling **\$ 10000000** against **100000000**, LLC ("**1000**") for the audit period September 1, 2004 through April 30, 2008. The following schedule reflects the amount of outstanding tax and applicable interest accrued to date:

Reriod	i Tex	Interestias of	lional
		3/14/2012	
09/01/04 - 12/31/04	4	\$	4
01/01/05 - 12/31/05	44	\$	\$
01/01/06 - 12/31/06	\$	\$	\$
01/01/07 - 12/31/07	\$	\$	\$
01/01/08 - 04/30/08	4	\$	\$
Total	\$	\$	\$

Kentucky

KentuckyUnbridledSpirit.com

An Equal Opportunity Employer M/F/D

, LLC March 14, 2012 - Final Ruling No. 2012-19 Page 2

River. At issue is whether various items of equipment, supplies and other property used in this dredging operation qualify for the exemption from sales and use tax set forth in KRS 139.483, which states:

The taxes imposed under the provisions of this chapter shall not apply to the sale of, or the storage, use, or other consumption of, ships and vessels, including property used in the repair or construction of, supplies and fuel consumed in the operation of, and supplies consumed by crew members aboard such ships and vessels which are used principally in the transportation of property or in the conveyance of persons for hire.

An exemption from taxation must be narrowly construed, with any doubts resolved against its application; moreover, a taxpayer claiming an exemption must establish that all statutory requirements are met. Popplewell's Alligator Dock No. 1, Inc. v. Revenue Cabinet, 133 S.W.3d 456, 461 (Ky. 2004); Epsilon Trading Co., Inc. v. Revenue Cabinet, 775 S.W.2d 937, 941 (Ky. App. 1989); KRS 139.260. The exemption set forth in KRS 139.483 does not exempt all ships and vessels and fuel, supplies and other property used or consumed in the repair, construction or operation of those ships and vessels. Instead, the ships and vessels must also be used principally in the transportation of property or in the conveyance of persons for hire.

The items in question primarily consist of 1) equipment referred to as a dredge, which describes as machinery or an apparatus that sits on a barge on the river, removing sand and gravel from the riverbed, processing it, and loading it onto barges to be taken to the shore for unloading and stockpiling and 2) various supply items, equipment and other property used or consumed in the repair or operation of the dredge or in **100**'s dredging operations.

These items do not qualify for the exemption set forth in KRS 139.483 primarily because they are not used principally in the transportation of property or the conveyance of persons for hire. They are instead used in the process of dredging sand and gravel on or from the river.

This conclusion is supported by the Kentucky Supreme Court's decision in <u>Popplewell's</u> <u>Alligator Dock No. 1 v. Revenue Cabinet</u>, <u>supra</u>. In that case, an exemption was sought pursuant to KRS 139.483 for purchases of fuel used to operate houseboats rented for recreational and vacation purposes. The Supreme Court held that the houseboats were not used principally in transportation of property or in the conveyance of persons for hire, but "were used principally to provide lodging to vacationers and for their recreational purposes." 133 S.W.3d at 456. The same holding and reasoning apply here: the dredges and other items in question were used in **D**'s dredging operations and not merely to transport property. , LLC March 14, 2012 - Final Ruling No. 2012-19 Page 3

has therefore not established, nor can it establish, that it satisfied all the requirements of the tax exemption it claims to be applicable to its purchase, use, storage or other consumption of the items in question.

Based upon the foregoing, outstanding sales and use tax assessments totaling \$ (plus applicable interest) are legitimate liabilities of LLC due the Commonwealth of Kentucky.

This letter is the final ruling of the Department of Revenue.

APPEAL

You may appeal this final ruling to the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals pursuant to the provisions of KRS 131.110, KRS 131.340-131.365, 103 KAR 1:010 and 802 KAR 1:010. If you decide to appeal this final ruling, your petition of appeal must be filed at the principal office of the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals, 128 Brighton Park Boulevard, Frankfort, Kentucky 40601-3714, within thirty (30) days from the date of this final ruling. The rules of the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals, which are set forth in 802 KAR 1:010, require that the petition of appeal must:

- 1. Be filed in quintuplicate;
- 2. Contain a brief statement of the law and facts in issue;
- 3. Contain the petitioner's or appellant's position as to the law and facts; and
- 4. Include a copy of this final ruling with each copy of the petition of appeal.

The petition of appeal must be in writing and signed by the petitioner or appellant. Filings by facsimile or other electronic means shall not be accepted.

Proceedings before the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals are conducted in accordance with 103 KAR 1:010, 802 KAR 1:010 and KRS 131.340-131.365 and KRS Chapter 13B. Formal hearings are held by the Board concerning the tax appeals before it, with all testimony and proceedings officially reported. Legal representation of parties to appeals before the Board is governed by the following rules set forth in Section 3 of 802 KAR 1:010:

- 1. An individual may represent himself in any proceedings before the Board where his individual tax liability is at issue or he may obtain an attorney to represent him in those proceedings;
- 2. An individual who is not an attorney may not represent any other individual or legal entity in any proceedings before the Board;

, LLC

March 14, 2012 - Final Ruling No. 2012-19 Page 4

- 3. Any party appealing a final ruling to the Board other than an individual, such as a corporation, limited liability company, partnership, joint venture, estate or other legal entity, shall be represented by an attorney in all proceedings before the Board, including the filing of the petition of appeal; and
- 4. An attorney who is not licensed to practice in Kentucky may practice before the Board only if he complies with Rule 3.030(2) of the Rules of the Kentucky Supreme Court.

You will be notified by the Clerk of the Board of the date and time set for any hearing.

Sincerely, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION CABINET

Jeffey Mole E. Jeffer Mosley

Interim Executive Director Office of Legal Services for Revenue

CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

